



Staff Report

PLANNING DIVISION
COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

To: Salt Lake City Planning Commission

From: David J. Gellner, AICP, Principal Planner
(801) 535-6107
david.gellner@slcgov.com

Date: July 13, 2016

Re: PLNPCM2016-00132 – Salt Lake City Fire Station #3 – Sugar House/Forest Dale Golf Course

CONDITIONAL USE

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 2425 South 900 East
PARCEL ID: 16-20-328-001-0000
MASTER PLAN: Sugar House
ZONING DISTRICT: PL-2 (Public Lands)

REQUEST:

Blalock and Partners, an architectural firm representing Salt Lake City, is requesting a conditional use approval for a new fire station to be located at approximately 2425 South 900 East, to the south of the existing Forest Dale Golf Course Club House. The subject property is located within Council District 7, represented by Lisa Adams.

RECOMMENDATION: Based on the information in this staff report, planning staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve the proposed conditional use project subject to the conditions listed below.

The following motion is provided in support of the recommendation:

Based on the findings and information listed in the staff report and the testimony and plans presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the requested conditional use application for a new fire station under PLNPCM2016-00132 subject to the following conditions:

- 1. An emergency vehicle warning system beacon will be installed on 900 East to aid in mitigating any traffic issues and ensure safe traffic operations.*
- 2. Applicant shall comply with all other department/division requirements.*

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Vicinity Map
- B. Photographs
- C. Site Plan & Building Elevations
- D. Additional Applicant Information
- E. Existing Conditions & Zoning Requirements
- F. Analysis of Standards
- G. Public Process and Comments
- H. Department Comments
- I. Motions

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

This request is for a new fire station to be located at approximately 2425 South 900 East, adjacent to the existing Forest Dale Golf Course Club House. The proposed station will replace the existing Salt Lake City Fire Station #3 which is located on Simpson Avenue adjacent to Fairmont Park. The majority of the Sugar House area is served by the current Station #3. Fire stations operated by the City of South Salt Lake and Salt Lake County serve small portions of Sugar House through a Mutual Aid Agreement. Fire Station 3's primary service area will be 1700 East to 500 East, and 1700 South to the southern Salt Lake City limit. In 2013, the existing station had a total of 2104 response calls, of which 444 were for fire and 1660 were for medical calls.

The zoning designation of the property for the station was changed from Open Space to the current Public Lands district in 2015. The Sugar House Master Plan was also updated in order to accommodate a new station at this location. Per Section 21A.33.070 of the Zoning Ordinance, municipal service uses, including city utility uses and police and fire stations require conditional use review in the PL-2 zoning district.

The station will be accessed from 900 East. It is designed to have engines enter via a driveway on the north side of the site and then circulate or pull through the site to enter the station bays from the east side of the station. Exiting of engines and equipment will be westward onto 900 East from the station bays, eliminating the need to back up equipment into the station upon returning from response calls. This is a common and desirable design for modern stations for both efficiency and to address traffic safety issues stemming from backing equipment into a station. The station will initially house one engine and an ambulance crew. The station will also accommodate a ladder truck at a future time in order to adequately serve taller new development in the community and Sugar House Business District. The current station cannot physically hold a ladder truck and the site is too constrained for it to be expanded in order to accommodate this equipment.

As many as 10 different sites were considered, including the current site for a new fire station. This site has been chosen for several reasons including response ability (allows apparatus quick response in and around the Sugar House community), long term viability considering the growth in the area and ability to serve the citizens within the four (4) minute response criteria, and lot size (available for Branch Operations in disaster situations). In addition, this will be the only City fire station located south of I-80 which and will be a critical for emergency response in the event of a natural disaster.

The station will be a two-storey design with a flat roof. This design will accommodate a solar panel array in order to meet the City's net zero energy goals for public projects. It will achieve a LEED Gold design standard. The station will also include a multi-purpose training and community room that may also function as a larger "command center" for disaster and emergency response operations. In addition, there will be space for the SLC Police Department at the station to provide a local Police presence in the community. The SLCPD will operate out of both dedicated and shared-use space within the station. The design of the station was largely influenced by the equipment and mission needs for the station, size of site and the need to meet the City's net zero energy goals.

The station will be designed to house up to eleven (11) fire department personnel. In addition, two (2) police officers may be present on a regular basis. Parking for the station is a combination of onsite and shared parking with the Forest Dale Golf Course. Onsite parking will be secure, with approximately twelve (12) dedicated spaces for SLC Fire personnel and two (2) for SLC Police officers. Additional parking can be accommodated in the parking lot for the Forest Dale Golf Course through a shared parking agreement.

Additional information in regard to the station design is provided in the narrative included in **Attachment D: Additional Applicant Information**.

KEY ISSUES:

The key issues associated with this proposal are:

1. Compatibility with adjacent properties
2. Compatibility with the Forest Dale Golf Course Club House, a City Landmark

The key issues listed below have been identified through the analysis of the project and standards (Attachment F), neighbor input, and, department review comments.

Issue 1 - Compatibility with Adjacent Properties

Concerns have been raised about traffic impacts, noise, visual disturbance and the impact on property values that may result from the proposed fire station. Concerns generally focused on station operations such as siren noise, flashing lights, and traffic impacts as equipment and personnel leave the station at unpredictable intervals given the nature of ongoing station operations.

The Fire Department deals with these operational concerns at all neighborhood-based stations and is very sensitive to the issue of impacting neighboring property owners and strives to be a “good neighbor”. Fire Department staff is advised to use caution when employing lights and sirens during after-hours response. Equipment testing is also timed to minimize the overall impact on neighbors. These operational protocols will help to reduce potential impacts and make the use compatible with adjacent properties.

No evidence exists to support the notion that property values will be impacted by the presence of a neighborhood fire station. Public comments have also indicated that such a facility would also be desirable in terms of allowing shorter response times on emergency calls to their homes. This quicker response for people needing medical attention and in the case of a major natural disaster seemed desirable and it was overall positive to live close to the station.

A flashing traffic signal is used at some stations to give driver’s additional warning of equipment leaving the station. This may also lessen the need for lights and sirens to be employed at times. The Fire Department believes that a traffic signal would serve both the citizens and FD in regard to safety and service at this location.

Issue 2 – Compatibility with the Forest Dale Golf Course Club House, a City Landmark

City policies recognize and support Historic Preservation. The adjacent Forest Dale Golf Course Club House is designated as a Local Landmark Site and is subject to the H Historic Preservation Overlay District. This means that alterations to the Club House must be reviewed according to the standards in the zoning ordinance.

The portion of the golf course property proposed for the rezone and master plan amendment is not within the Historic Preservation Overlay Zone and therefore, is not required to follow those standards. However, one of the conditional use standards is consistency with adopted master plans. The Community Preservation Plan (2012) requires that City Projects should avoid, minimize or mitigate adverse effects on historic properties on the City or National Register.

The community has expressed some concerns about the design of the station and how it will fit into the community in which it is located, particularly how it will impact the adjacent club house. The City has gone through extensive efforts to design the station in a way that satisfies the standards for approval and mitigates any adverse aspects of the project while simultaneously keeping the essential function and mission of the station in mind as the foremost goal. This included additional meetings with the Sugar House Community Council and working directly with SHCC representatives to help refine and evolved the design to address community concerns. The refined design was presented at an SHCC meeting on June 1, 2016. Specific concerns expressed by the public and the SHCC included the following:

A. Historic character of Sugar House and fitting into the community

Staff’s Response:

While the proposed station is not in a historic district, it will be located immediately adjacent to a City Landmark site. During the rezoning process for this site, discussion took place in terms of designing the station to be sensitive to the context of the Forest Dale Golf Course Club House.

The SHMP speaks to a history of development in the area that occurred over a long period of time and in numerous phases. This rich development history has generally created a community fabric of eclectic and mixed styles, with no one particular style dominating the landscape. Bungalows, larger Queen Anne or Victorian style houses, large lot suburban type developments, urban development and both low and higher density commercial development can all be found in Sugar House. There is not one dominant or characteristic style in the community, a fact that

adds to the character and appeal of the community. Staff believes that proposed use will further add to the eclectic nature and fabric of the community that exists today, and continues to evolve.

B. Impact on the historic nature of the site and compliance with historic design guidelines

Staff's Response:

Salt Lake City has adopted Historic Design Guidelines for new construction within historic districts. As mentioned previously, while the proposed use is not on a historic site, nor within a larger historic district, the City is sensitive to the location context as it relates to the golf course and club house. Given the location, the Design Guidelines for New Construction in Historic Districts were considered in the staff analysis of the proposal. The City has design guidelines for both Historic Residential Properties and Districts (Chapter 12) and Historic Commercial Properties and Districts (Chapter 13). A fire station does not fit discreetly into either category. It is larger in scale and closer to the massing of a commercial building but the surrounding zoning is residential. To address this, staff looked at both sets of guidelines in relation to the proposed use. The following items are included in the guidelines:

Chapter 12 – Residential Historic Design Guidelines

- The goal of the guidelines in this chapter is to protect the historic and architectural character of each neighborhood, while allowing new, compatible design.
- "... it is important to realize that while a historic district conveys a certain sense of time and place associated with its history, it also remains dynamic..."
- 12.18 - Materials should have a proven durability for the regional climate and the situation and aspect of the building.
- The replication of historic styles is generally discouraged. Replication may blur the distinction between old and new buildings, clouding the interpretation of the architectural evolution of a district or setting.

Chapter 13 – Commercial Historic Design Guidelines

- Architectural Character - While it is important that new development reinforce the basic character-defining features in an area, it is not necessary that it replicate or echo historic architectural styles.
- 13.11 – The exact imitation of earlier architectural styles is discouraged. New buildings should reflect their period of construction.

The proposed use has taken into account the site context, historic concerns and the historic design guidelines. It will be constructed of durable materials and will reflect the modern period of construction. As such, staff believes that the use will not have a negative impact on the site, neighboring historic assets and that it meets the intent of the City's Historic Design Guidelines, for both Residential and Commercial properties and districts.

Note: It should be noted that while there were negative comments and concerns expressed in regard to the station design and community compatibility, there were also a significant number of positive comments made in regard to the proposed design. Many people liked the design and felt that it was appropriate for the community and was "... a perfect blend between Old School Sugarhouse and the new generation Sugarhouse." to quote one comment card submitted by a resident in relation to the project.

DISCUSSION:

NEXT STEPS:

If approved, the applicant may proceed with the project and will be required to obtain all necessary building permits for construction of the station.

ATTACHMENT A: Vicinity Map



ATTACHMENT B: Photographs



Site location for Fire Station 3 – view south from the Forest Dale Club House parking lot



Site location view looking north-east from 900 East – Forest Dale Club House visible in center background



Site location
for Fire Station
3 – view
looking east
across 900
East



Neighborhood
development
on 900 East
immediately
across from
the proposed
site reflects an
eclectic mix of
styles, single
and low-
density multi-
family
development,
and different
eras of
construction.



The Forest Dale Golf Course Club House – a City Landmark and National Historic Register Site



Current Sugar House Fire Station 3 located on Simpson Ave. near Fairmont Park

ATTACHMENT C: Site Plan and Building Drawings

Renderings of the proposed station elevation and site plan are included on the following pages.







Existing Site Wall

Site fencing/gate shifted back to enhance entry experience

Existing Site Wall

Low level drought tolerant plantings – reinforce pedestrian experience

Site walls to align with existing site wall and reinforce sidewalk axis; provide warmth and organic connection to site

ATTACHMENT D: Additional Applicant Information

An explanation of the design and the design process from the architect is included on the following pages.

CONDITIONAL USE APPLICATION: Fire Station 03 – 2425 South 900 East DESIGN NARRATIVE

The Sugarhouse district is a vibrant and diverse part of the greater Salt Lake City fabric. The area includes traditional residential neighborhoods and a growing, walkable commercial / retail downtown. Architecturally, the area is also diverse with styles and construction representative of the eras in which they were built. Throughout Sugarhouse there is a broad range of materials, colors and textures used on both historic buildings and newer construction, and in both residential and commercial settings. Station 03 is sited in a unique location: it is not within a traditional neighborhood, nor is it in an urban or highly developed area. The site is on the edge of the Forest Dale Golf Course, adjacent to the parking lot of an historic clubhouse, and along 900 East – a two-lane road.

To achieve a stronger civic identity, Station 03 is conceived as a two-story structure, which serves to balance the height of the apparatus bays. Because of the site constraints, the building needed to be placed closer to 900 East resulting in a more commanding presence, but also still in compliance with the required setbacks.

Parking for the new Station is achieved with both onsite parking and a shared parking agreement between the Fire Station and the Forest Dale Golf Course, both city-owned properties. The onsite parking is secure for fire and police personnel with 12 dedicated stalls for the fire fighters and two spaces for police. To support community-related meetings that might occur at the Station, the golf course parking lot provides additional parking through a shared parking agreement.

The site development reinforces the connectivity between the golf course and the fire station. An “entry plaza” stretches between the two parcels to facilitate community access to the Station from the golf course parking area. Two existing, mature trees at the northeast corner of the site will remain and a new row of trees will be planted as a buffer between the golf course and the fire station property. Similarly, a row of planting will be created at the north edge of the property as a buffer between the golf course parking lot and the fire station entry drive.

The architecture of the new fire station will include exterior materials that are timeless, durable and sustainable. High-performance concrete panels, brick, terra-cotta and metal panels are some of the cladding options currently being considered. Energy-efficient, operable windows provide abundant natural light and ventilation for the occupants as well as create an open and inviting aesthetic to the public.

The Station 03 design seeks to respect the historic nature of the Forestdale Clubhouse by creating a complementary building representative of the era in which the new station is being designed & constructed. Although the project is not in a historic district or a part of a historic site, the design team will be using the *Salt Lake City Historic District New Construction Guidelines* as

an additional resource when evaluating appropriate design decisions. In addition, the design process will incorporate input from community council meetings and SLC Planning meetings.

One of the project's requirements is to achieve net zero energy status, which, put simply, means that the implemented design solution must generate as much energy as the facility consumes. This requires a large photovoltaic (PV) array on the roof of the structure. The proposed design solution conceals from view the PV panels but maximizes the efficiency of the panels by placing them at the most beneficial solar angle. The design team believes that an expressive "solar canopy" - where the PV array is a dominant roof element - is not appropriate for the Sugarhouse site.

CONDITIONAL USE INFORMATION

Salt Lake City Fire Station 03: 2425 South 900 East

ANTICIPATED OPERATING / DELIVERY HOURS

As a fire station, the facility will be occupied and operate all hours of the day, every day. There are no deliveries to this facility, but emergency vehicles will be coming and going at irregular times. The facility shares space with a SLC police presence where suspects could be detained, for observation and questioning, for a short period of time. The police will operate out of approximately 1500 SF within the facility, which is spread between dedicated and shared-use spaces.

ADJACENT LAND USES

To the north and east, the fire station property is bounded by the city-owned Forest Dale Golf Course (OS Zone). Immediately to the north is the parking lot serving the golf course, while the course's 9th fairway is along the immediate east edge of the property. The two-lane, 900 East forms the western property boundary with a mix of single-family and multi-family residences across the street (RMF-30 Zone). To the south, the Neptune Divers shop is leasing the land from the City.

NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES

Fire Station 03 will run regular shifts of 11 employees per shift. As noted, they will be occupying the building 24/7, and year round. It is possible that one to two police officers may also be present on a regular basis.

NUMBER OF SEATS

In addition to the regular fire-fighting staff, the facility also contains a Community Meeting Room. In order to better serve the local community with flexible meeting space, the project has incorporated a 970 SF Meeting Room that can accommodate approximately 60 people. It is expected that this space would have the highest use between the hours of 4:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.

COMMUNITY ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The design team has not yet engaged any Sugarhouse District residents, but we will be working with SLC Planning to get on the Community Council and Sugarhouse Land Use Council meeting schedules.



ATTACHMENT E: Existing Conditions & Zoning Regulations

Existing Conditions:

CURRENT ZONING REQUIREMENTS

The property is located within the PL-2 (Public Lands) zoning district. Per Section 21A.33.070 of the Zoning Ordinance, municipal service uses, including city utility uses and police and fire stations require conditional use review.

ADJACENT LAND USE

The land use and zoning surrounding the site is:

- **North:** To the north of the proposed station lies the Forest Dale Club House and associate parking. It is zoned Open Space (OS). Beyond the site to the north lies Interstate 80.
- **East:** To the east lies the Forest Dale Golf Course which is zoned OS (Open Space). The closest development does not start until past the eastern boundary of the golf course, in excess of 1,200 feet from the edge of the fire station property itself.
- **South:** To the south, the property contains Neptune Divers, a local business. This business is located on City-owned property that is leased to the operator of the site. The property is zoned OS (Open Space).
- **West:** To the west of the subject property, on the west side of 900 East, the property is zoned a mix of R-1-7000 – Single-Family Residential and RMF-30 – Low Density Multi-Family Residential. The land has been developed for single-family houses as well as some apartment units and smaller multi-family residential uses and townhomes.

ATTACHMENT F: ANALYSIS OF STANDARDS

21A.54.080 Standards for Conditional Use

Approval Standards: A conditional use shall be approved unless the planning commission, or in the case of administrative conditional uses, the planning director or designee, concludes that the following standards cannot be met:

1. The use complies with applicable provisions of this title;

Analysis: The property is located in the PL-2 (Public Lands) zoning district. Per Section 21A.40.090 (E) of the Zoning Ordinance, all municipal service uses including a fire or police station in the PL-2 zone require conditional use approval.

Finding: The proposal complies with the applicable provisions of the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance. It is allowed in the zone through the conditional use process and complies with all City requirements for such a facility.

2. The use is compatible, or with conditions of approval can be made compatible, with surrounding uses;

Analysis: Surrounding uses include a mix of residential and open space properties. There has been concern expressed about how the fire station will fit in context with regard to the adjacent neighborhood.

Finding: Staff finds that the use will be compatible with surrounding uses. The site itself only has residential neighbors directly to the west of the site, across 900 East. This in itself makes it an ideal location for such a use. A condition to require the installation of an emergency vehicle warning system beacon on 900 East to ensure safe traffic operations has been recommend by staff.

While station operations may have some temporary impacts on the surrounding uses in terms of noise, these events will usually be short in duration as equipment and personnel leave the station. Item #13 in the Detrimental Effects Determination chart below also addresses this issue in the following manner:

The Fire Department deals with operational concerns at all neighborhood-based stations and is very sensitive to the issue of impacting neighboring property owners and strives to be a “good neighbor”. Fire Department staff is advised to use caution when employing lights and sirens during after-hours response. Equipment testing is also timed to minimize the overall impact on neighbors. These operating procedures will help to make the use compatible with surrounding uses.

3. The use is consistent with applicable adopted city planning policies, documents, and master plans; and

Analysis:

The Sugar House Master Plan (SHMP - 2005) includes the Sugar House Community Development Objectives. The following objectives are applicable to the proposal:

- Strengthen and support existing neighborhoods with appropriate adjacent land uses and design guidelines to preserve the character of the area.
- Provide the needed infrastructure improvements through public, as well as public/private partnerships.

The SHMP sets a goal for strengthening and supporting existing neighborhoods through the identification and establishment of needed capital improvements. This proposed use would meet the intent of that goal, providing a necessary public safety facility in the community in order to replace an existing facility that no longer meets the needs of the community.

While the proposed station is not in a historic district, it will be located immediately adjacent to a City Landmark site. During the rezoning process for this site, discussion took place in terms of designing the station to be sensitive to the context of the Forest Dale Golf Course Club House. The City’s Historic Design Guidelines have been considered in relation to the proposal. This is discussed in more detail in the Key Issues section of this report.

The Future Land Use Map in the Sugar House Master Plan was amended in 2015 to allow for the establishment of this fire station. The property was originally zoned Open Space (OS) which does not allow a fire station or other municipal service use. The master plan was changed and the site was rezoned to the Public Lands (PL-2) zoning district by City Council. The proposed use is therefore consistent with the master plan for the area.

Finding: Staff finds that the project does not conflict with the Sugar House Community Master Plan, adopted city policies or other documents including the Historic Design Guidelines and the objectives of those documents. Staff finds that the proposal meets this standard.

4. The anticipated detrimental effects of a proposed use can be mitigated by the imposition of reasonable conditions (refer to Detrimental Impacts Chart below for details).

Analysis: The anticipated detrimental effects of the proposed fire station include operational concerns that occur at all neighborhood-based stations. The Fire Department staff is very sensitive to the issue of impacting neighboring property owners and use operating procedures to help the use be less disruptive on the neighborhood in which they are located. A traffic signal will be employed to aid in traffic safety.

Finding: Staff finds that any anticipated detrimental impacts from the proposed use will be reasonably mitigated through operational procedures and the design of the station.

21a.54.080B Detrimental Effects Determination

In analyzing the anticipated detrimental effects of a proposed use, the planning commission shall determine compliance with each of the following:

Criteria	Finding	Rationale
1. This title specifically authorizes the use where it is located	Complies	A municipal service use such as a fire or police station is allowed as a conditional use in the PL-2 zone.
2. The use is consistent with applicable policies set forth in adopted citywide, community, and small area master plans and future land use maps	Complies	The future land use map of the Sugar House Master Plan was amended in 2015 to allow the zoning change for this property in anticipation of the proposed use of a fire station at this site. The proposed use is consistent with the master plan.
3. The use is well-suited to the character of the site, and adjacent uses as shown by an analysis of the intensity, size, and scale of the use compared to existing uses in the surrounding area	Complies	There are no residential neighbors to the immediate north, south and east of the site. Land to the west of the site on the other side of 900 East have been developed for residential uses. The site limits the number of residential neighbors and provides access onto a main arterial road, 900 East.
4. The mass, scale, style, design, and architectural detailing of the surrounding structures as they relate to the proposed have been considered	Complies	The design of the station has been carefully considered in terms of the site, the historic structures on the property and mass and scale of the building. The station has a sloped roof design in order to accomplish the City’s net zero energy and sustainability goals. While the facility may appear taller than the neighboring club house due to the placement closer to the street, it is approximately the same height as the club house parapet itself at the highest point.

<p>5. Access points and driveways are designed to minimize grading of natural topography, direct vehicular traffic onto major streets, and not impede traffic flows</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>A fire station or other emergency response facility requires easy access onto the street, ideally a major street for efficient response times. This location allows for that and the station will be accessed via 900 East with a pull-through design that eliminates the need to back onto the street for entering or exiting the station. An emergency vehicle warning system beacon should be installed on 900 East to aid in mitigating any traffic issues and to ensure safe traffic operations. This type of signal is commonly used at other stations and helps to enhance traffic safety by providing drivers additional advanced warning of vehicles exiting the station.</p>
<p>6. The internal circulation system is designed to mitigate adverse impacts on adjacent property from motorized, non-motorized, and pedestrian traffic</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>Engines will enter from and leave the station via 900 East. Engines will enter via a driveway on the north side of the site and then circulate or pull through the site to enter the station bays to pull out forward onto 900 East. This will eliminate the need to back up equipment into the station upon returning from response calls which will mitigate adverse impacts on adjacent properties.</p>
<p>7. The site is designed to enable access and circulation for pedestrian and bicycles</p>	<p>Not Applicable</p>	<p>Criteria #7 is not applicable to this proposal. Given the nature of fire operations and equipment, unrestricted pedestrian access around the site is not desirable. However, the station will have a pedestrian-scale front door entrance and pedestrian walkway to access the station for the public coming from the parking area.</p>
<p>8. Access to the site does not unreasonably impact the service level of any abutting or adjacent street</p>	<p>Complies with condition</p>	<p>The proposal will have no discernible traffic impact. A flashing traffic signal may also be installed that activates when engines are leaving the station. This type of signal is used at other stations and helps to enhance traffic safety by providing drivers additional advanced warning of the station location and active warning of equipment leaving the station.</p>
<p>9. The location and design of off-street parking complies with applicable standards of this code</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>Off-street parking will be provided both on the station site and within the parking lot for the Forest Dale Golf Course Club House through a shared parking agreement. There will be adequate parking to accommodate the anticipated needs at the station.</p>
<p>10. Utility capacity is sufficient to support the use at normal service levels</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>The proposal will not require additional utility service. The subject property is located within a built environment where public facilities and services exist with regard to development of the property.</p>
<p>11. The use is appropriately screened, buffered, or separated from adjoining dissimilar uses to mitigate potential use conflicts</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>A row of trees will be planted between the fire station property and the golf course itself to provide some screening. In addition, a row of trees will be planted on the north side of the site to create separation and screening between the station drive entrance and the golf course parking lot.</p>
<p>12. The use meets City sustainability plans, does not significantly impact the quality of surrounding air and water, encroach into a river or stream, or introduce any hazard or environmental damage to any adjacent property, including cigarette smoke</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>The use does not significantly impact sustainability plans nor does it encroach onto a stream or water way. The station has been designed to achieve the net zero sustainability goals that the City has established, and achieve LEED Gold status so will be a particularly efficient facility.</p>

<p>13. The hours of operation and delivery of the use are compatible with surrounding uses</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>The hours of use for a fire station and when emergency calls happen as well as the scale of response needed are unpredictable. The Fire Department deals with operational concerns at all neighborhood-based stations and is very sensitive to the issue of impacting neighboring property owners and strives to be a “good neighbor”. Fire Department staff is advised to use caution when employing lights and sirens during after-hours response. Equipment testing is also timed to minimize the overall impact on neighbors. These operating procedures will help to make the use compatible with surrounding uses.</p>
<p>14. Signs and lighting are compatible with, and do not negatively impact surrounding uses</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>The proposal will not require extensive signs and/or lighting. A small sign indicating the use of the building and marking it as a civic facility will be integrated into the west-facing elevation of the building. Site lighting will be confined to that which is necessary for marking the station and navigating the site safely.</p>
<p>15. The proposed use does not undermine preservation of historic resources and structures</p>	<p>Complies</p>	<p>While the site itself is not in a historic district, it is located immediately adjacent to a City Landmark site. The proposed use has been considered in context of that site in order to not visually overpower the existing club house. The design has been carefully modified, with community input to incorporate several design elements to allow a “flow” and convergence of the two sites and provide some continuity. The station itself is a modern design but consideration and care were given to the design and the Historic Preservation and Design Guidelines for New Construction were followed in designing the new station. This issue is further addressed in the Key Issues section of this report in Issue 2 – Compatibility with the Forest Dale Golf Course Club House, a City Landmark. Staff does not believe that the new station will undermine historic resources or structures, specifically the Forest Dale Club House and Golf Course and that the proposal complies with this criterion.</p>

Finding: In analyzing the anticipated detrimental effects of the proposed use, Staff finds that the request complies with the criteria listed above.

ATTACHMENT G: Public Process and Comments

Public Notice, Meetings, Comments

The following is a list of public meetings that have been held, and other public input opportunities, related to the proposed project:

PUBLIC PROCESS AND INPUT

- The application was received by Planning on February 29, 2016
- The petition was assigned to David Gellner, Principal Planner, for staff analysis and processing on March 1, 2016
- Information was sent to the Sugar House Community Council (SHCC) on March 2, 2016 requesting review of the application in accordance with the 45- day public notice period specified in City Code.
- Planning and other City staff attended SHCC Land Use and Zoning (LUZ) Sub-Committee Meeting on March 21, 2016.
- Planning and other City staff attended the regular SHCC meeting on April 6, 2016.
- Planning and other City staff met with members of the SHCC on May 25, 2016 to work on refining the station design.
- Planning and other City staff attended the regular SHCC meeting on June 1, 2016.
- Letters from the SHCC were provided to staff after the LUZ and regular meetings. Those letters dated respectively on June 21st, April 19th and April 18, 2016 respectively are attached on the following pages.
- Public notice mailings were sent out on June 29, 2016.
- Public notice was posted on City and State websites and sent via the Planning Division list serve on June 29, 2016.
- On June 29, 2016, a sign was physically posted on the property giving notice of the Planning Commission Public Hearing.

June 21, 2016

TO: Salt Lake City Planning Commission

FROM: Judi Short, Vice Chair and Land Use Chair
Sugar House Community Council

RE: Sugar House Fire Station #3
Revised Drawing 5/25/2016



Several of us appreciated the opportunity to meet again with Kevin Blalock and the team involved in the Fire Station #3 design. We are pleased that a new stone wall was added to the design, to sort of echo the wall in front of the Forest Dale Club House. We also appreciate the fact that space has been allocated to continue the vegetable garden (grown by the firefighters) on the west side of the station, although it does not yet show on the drawings I have. There has been an attempt to make the front façade of the building more human scale, with the addition of a roof over the entrance and a few additional windows along the first floor. One of the windows on the second floor on the right side of the Community Terrace has had the frame popped out a bit, again to echo what can be seen on the Club House.

We are told that the sidewalks in front of the building will be widened, to enhance the pedestrian walking experience. This is a heavily travelled sidewalk, which could benefit widening all the way from the streetcar to 2700 South. And, we are encouraged to think that additional landscaping will help to soften the boxy building exterior.

We spent quite a bit of time reviewing slides of various surface materials for the building. While it is difficult to tell exactly what the effect of some of these materials will do to soften the building design a bring it more in line with the rest of Sugar House, some of the stone exteriors seemed to help with that quite a bit. It was clear that the architect was leaning toward using copper as one of the exterior materials, and he explained how it would age and change color, and could be “stopped” in the middle of the aging point when it is a certain color and coated with a clear coat to keep it at that color, rather than aging further. We made a request that whatever materials are used in combination with the copper be of a color that would nicely compliment the copper when aged, rather than ending up looking like an all gray, or all one color building 20 years from now.

We still think the building is too starkly modern for our tastes, but acknowledge that about one-third of the comments we have received about this project absolutely love it. At our last meeting, the comments we received indicate that people still don't think this fits in well with our community. It doesn't respect the historic guidelines as described in our Sugar House Master Plan. We should show more deference to the historic Forest Dale Park Golf Course and Club House, which is directly adjacent, as well as the Forest Dale Historic Neighborhood in close proximity. We look forward to seeing a more final design and materials at the Planning Commission meeting on July 13.

April 19, 2016

To: Salt Lake City Planning Commission

FROM: Judi Short, Land Use Chair and Vice Chair
Sugar House Community Council

RE: PLNPCM2016-00132 – Salt Lake City Fire Station #3
Conditional Use Approval



We have received, and reviewed, the request for a Conditional Use for a new fire station to be located at approximately 2425 South 900 East. The architect came to the Sugar House Community Council (SHCC) Land Use and Zoning (LUZ) Committee meeting March 21, and the regular meeting of SHCC on April 6, to present the proposed design and ask for feedback on the conditional use for this project. We put flyers on many of the homes in the surrounding area, and a number of neighbors attended one of our meetings or sent in comments.

You previously received our letter of February 19, 2015 concerning the request to rezone the land and locate the fire station on this parcel. And, you know that we approved that request. At that time, we told planning staff, the architects in attendance at the Open House, and you, at the Planning Commission public hearing, that we expected the design of the new fire station to be informed by the design of the Forest Dale Club House. We see no evidence that anyone paid a bit of attention to that request. We see no evidence that anyone even looked at the Sugar House Master Plan.

There was no one from Sugar House on the steering committee for this project. This is our first opportunity to make comments about the direction this design is going, and it is pretty far along for changes to be made. The community, including Lisa Adams, is really taken aback by this procedure. We originally felt like we were really included, but apparently that was just a smiley face looking back at us and nodding heads. We thought that we would get a design that reflected the character of the Sugar House neighborhood. However, the architect implied that he got to design the building, and then get feedback. Apparently, we don't get to give feedback before he comes to us for it.

We appreciate the fact that the city has a net zero impact in terms of power usage, I wish we all could achieve that. And we understand that Mr. Blalock saved time and money designing two fire stations at the same time. But that doesn't mean they both have to look alike. The insides might be similar, but the outside façade should reflect the neighborhood where it is to be built. These buildings should be very different on the exterior. The Forest Dale Golf Course and Club House are both on the National Historic Register, as well as the Utah Historic Register. The Forest Dale neighborhood is on the National Register. For all intents and purposes, this parcel is in the historic district. Wasn't this originally the parking lot of the Salt Lake Country Club, before it became a salt pile? That Club and its history is one of the reasons why this Forest Dale Golf Course and Club House have achieved this recognition.

Mr. Blalock says he used the SLC Design Guidelines for Historic Districts. He focused his efforts on how this responds to the historic district. I have attached Chapter 12 for you, in case you have not seen it. Those guidelines say that for new construction in a historic district, all new construction should also reflect the era in which it was designed and built. We think this has gone to the extreme. It ONLY

reflects the buildings that are being built in 2016, which for the most part, are very stark modern buildings. It does not at all reflect the historic area of our neighborhood called Sugar House.

No one wants a replica of the wonderful mission revival clubhouse. However, we do want a building that feels a bit like Sugar House. It is hard to believe that a building can't have a more traditional look and feel, and still have room for many solar voltaic panels. A short parapet wall could hide them from the street (remember, this is a two story building). The parapet could echo some of the roof curves of the club house without adding a lot of height. Or, the top edge of the wall could be the same edge that is on the club house, but a straight edge. The tops of the windows could be curved, the windows don't have to be tall and skinny, they could be wider. The second floor hangs over the first floor, which is very similar to the long porch on the south side of the club house, the design could incorporate arches under the overhang. We think there are many ways that could easily bring this building more into the character of Sugar House, and still have the energy efficiency that is required. I have attached a photo by Tom Wharton that gives you a good idea of the top edge of the parapet, and the curves to which I refer.

The materials could be more in keeping with our neighborhood. Maybe brick and wood, rather than copper and concrete. Or the materials could be brick and concrete. Instead of floor to ceiling windows, the top of the window could be lower and the windows wider, with a windowsill, like the bungalows. I know there are newly built, modern fire stations, that have a feel more in keeping with what we are looking for.

In all fairness, not everyone in Sugar House dislikes this design. I would say one-third like it, and two-thirds do not. I spoke with half a dozen architects, and their opinions were split. There seems to be good agreement that the design needs to be reworked. Our constituents have been watching us advocate for them on various land use issues over the years, and trust us to come up with the best solutions.

We would like a focus group with the architect, city staff, and a small group representing SHCC and/or the community at large, perhaps including Lisa Ramsey Adams, to discuss the key points of what we want in a new design. Then have a follow up with the architect with some sketches, so we can select the best one or two designs. The interior is fine with us, so these sketches would only relate to the exterior treatment, including materials. Have the architect put the sketches into photo-real plans like we have already seen, for presentation to the SHCC. We can send our letter of support after a majority of the SHCC, and community in attendance, select a design that fits with our neighborhood. We are happy to expedite this process in any way possible.

I have attached:

- A letter from the Chair of the Sugar House Community Council,
- Tom Wharton's photo from the Tribune dated 2012,
- Chapter 12 of SLC Design Guidelines for Historic Districts,
- The email comments I have received,
- Comment cards I have received, and
- The flyer distributed to the neighborhood
- Notes from the March 21 meeting of the SHCC Land Use Committee

April 18, 2016

Deavid Gellner

Salt Lake City Planning

RE: Fire Station # 3 Condition Use Permit

As chair of the Sugar House Community Council (SHCC) I am submitting this statement regarding the community participation (or absence thereof) on the new fire station design.

This fire station has been a long process beginning with a rezone. During the last open house held by SLC for the rezone the issue of design was brought up by a resident and followed up by SHCC members. We wanted to make sure the city knew we were concerned about design from the very beginning BEFORE any work started. It was stated in that meeting by SLC personnel that you were not at the design phase yet and indicated when it got to that point it was envisioned coming back to the community. That never happened. We first saw this design once it was completed and part of the condition use permit. It seems the previous administration hired the architect and that was that. During our Land Use & Zoning Committee the architect indicated they formed a steering committee. When pressed why no community member was invited to participated the architect stated he "didn't think it was necessary".

Community Councils by definition are organization that advocate for community involvement. The attitude displayed by the architect in excluding the community troubles us. The lack of communication from the administration to the architect about community involvement troubles us as it has led to this situation.

As you are aware the Forest Dale golf course and clubhouse is listed on the National Historic Registry. In fact, this is the only golf course to have such a distinction in the entire state. The Forest Dale neighborhood is our only Historic Neighborhood. It should surprise no one that many in the community pay special attention to this relationship.

Another issue that disturbs us is the complete disregard for the Sugar House Master Plan. We find it amusing to hear the architect claim they actually looked at this document because there is zero evidence of this in the design. SLC and the Planning Commission are well aware of what goes into a master plan. However, I would like to say the update done to ours was in 2005 and numerous community members participated by meeting twice a month for over 2 years to insure that the vision and goals for how we want our community grow and look like was adequately expressed.

One can barely count the references within our master plan to historic architecture and character. It even calls for new construction to honor this fact. We heard a lot from the architect about federal guidelines and state recommendations on historic design, but never once did they indicate they valued or even looked at the Sugar House Master Plan. Given that they also deemed it unnecessary for the community to participate on their steering committee this is not surprised, but is certainly disappointing.

As chair of the SHCC I recognize that some people like the design offered and some people dislike the design offered. I feel it is my role to advocate for community involvement. It is my role to bring attention to the fact that our master plan has been disregarded to the extent it might as well has been thrown in the trash. It is my role to highlight that our historic character continues to be eroded by designs such as these. We can do little for the designs done by private developers, but the city should be more cognizant of master plans, historic character and community involvement. As new construction rises that follow this trend of shipping container architecture future projects will mimic these designs (we have seen this start already) and our historic character will be lost.

Community involvement was thwarted by the architect and this designs falls extremely short of the vision articulated in our master plan. It is a disappointment that this is the best the city can offer in terms of community engagements and adherence to our master plan. This is our community fire station and with its proximity to our historic clubhouse a little attention to actually honoring this architectural relationship was warranted.

Regards,



Amy Barry

SHCC, Chair

www.sugarhousecouncil.org



sugarhousecouncil@yahoo.com

ATTACHMENT H: Department Comments

The proposal was sent out for internal review by other City departments. The following comments were received in regard to the proposal:

Engineering (Scott Weiler): No objections to the proposed conditional use. Civil plans will need to be reviewed and approved for the proposed modifications in the public way of 900 East and a Permit to Work in the Public Way must be obtained by a licensed contractor before performing work in the public way. A utility pole will need to be removed where it exists because a drive approach is proposed there.

No comments were received from Public Utilities, Transportation, Building or Zoning Review.

ATTACHMENT I: Motions

Potential Motions

Based on the findings listed in the staff report, it is the Planning Staff's opinion that the project adequately meets the applicable standards for a conditional use and therefore recommends the Planning Commission approve the application as proposed.

Consistent with Staff Recommendation: The motion recommended by the Planning Division is located on the cover page of this staff report. The recommendation is based upon the analysis included in this staff report.

Not Consistent with Staff Recommendation: Based on the information in this staff report, public testimony, and discussion by the Planning Commission, I move that the Planning Commission deny application PLNPCM201600132, for a fire station to be located at approximately 2425 South 900 East.

The Planning Commission shall make findings on the following conditional use standards and specifically state which standard or standards are not being complied with.

1. The use complies with applicable provisions of this title;
2. The use is compatible, or with conditions of approval can be made compatible, with surrounding uses;
3. The use is consistent with applicable adopted city planning policies, documents, and master plans; and
4. The anticipated detrimental effects of a proposed use can be mitigated by the imposition of reasonable conditions (refer to Detrimental Impacts Chart for details).